

***MINUTES OF THE
TWENTY-EIGHTH REGULAR SYNOD ASSEMBLY OF THE
METROPOLITAN NEW YORK SYNOD OF THE
EVANGELICAL LUTHERAN CHURCH IN AMERICA***

+

“CARE FOR CREATION”/ELECTION OF A BISHOP

**May 16-19, 2019
Westchester Marriott, Tarrytown, New York**

Assembly registration began at 8:00 am, followed by Orientation for Voting Members. The Opening of the Assembly was held at 10:00am.

THURSDAY, MAY 16, 2019

PLENARY SESSION I

At 10:15 am Bishop McCoid called the first plenary session to order.

Bishop McCoid welcomed the voting members, noting that this was a special and much anticipated assembly as it would raise up a new bishop to provide leadership and oversight for the next six years. With record attendance it was necessary to seat non-voting visitors in adjoining rooms where the proceedings were telecast on a video monitor. For interested persons not in attendance, the entire assembly was live-streamed. For Spanish-speaking voting members, a simultaneous translation service was made available.

After sharing some personal reflections on his ministry, Bishop McCoid read the words of the song “I Did it My Way,” by Frank Sinatra. The opening line was poignant: “And now the end is near, and so I face the final curtain.” But more poignant was how Bishop McCoid ended his welcoming remarks by saying, “Now, let me share something with you. We are gathered not for each one to say ‘I did it my way.’ We are gathered as God’s people to do it God’s way.” The assembly’s acclamation indicated the gratitude it felt for Bishop McCoid’s ministry.

Bishop McCoid next introduced Presiding Bishop Elizabeth Eaton as the ELCA representative who would oversee and run the election of bishop, thanking Bishop Eaton for her presence.

Bishop John Macholz of the Upstate New York Synod was welcomed as the Synod Assembly Chaplain.

Bishop McCoid then introduced the Synod Assembly Coordinator, Pastor Paul Johnsen, and Assembly Planning Committee Chair, Ms. Elizabeth Hoffmann, thanking them, along with the entire Assembly Planning Committee, Synod staff, volunteers and Marriott staff for their work in the coordination of the Assembly.

The Rev. Joel Brandt was introduced at the Chairperson of the Committee on Reference and Counsel and the assembly was reminded that the close of the first plenary session was the deadline to submit any resolutions or memorials from the floor.

Bishop McCoid then introduced the Rev. C. Anderson James, who served as Parliamentarian and Chairperson of the Bishop’s Election Committee. The members of the Bishop’s Election Committee were: The Rev. Patty Avila, Synod Deacon Karen Conlon, Synod Deacon Sarajeon Grainson, The Rev. Wolfgang Laudert, Ms. Emma Porter, Synod Deacon Rob Sinanan, and The Rev. Ann Tiemeyer.

Bishop McCoid then introduced the Synod staff:

- Ms. Susan Brandt, Executive Administrator
- The Rev. Percy Butiku, Asst. to the Bishop for Global and Multicultural Mission
- Ms. Regina Daniels, Executive Administrator
- Mr. Brandon Dupree, Interim Director for Evangelical Mission
- Mr. Roberto Lara, Director for Communications
- The Rev. Jonathan Linman, Asst. to the Bishop for Faith and Leadership Formation
- Ms. Maria Rodas, Administrator for the Executive Staff
- S.Dcn. Gayle Ruege, Senior Asst. to the Bishop
- Dcn. Margy Ajer, Asst. to the Bishop for Congregations, and
- The Rev. Lamont Anthony Wells, Asst. to the Bishop for Evangelical Mission/Director for Evangelical Mission.

The assembly then viewed a video on Parliamentary Procedure followed by a review of Assembly resources on the Synod website and the ELCA Guide app.

Then followed the introduction of The Rev. Kevin O’Hara, Chair of Nominations and Elections, and an introduction to the voting devices by Jean Knight of Quizdom.

Report of the Committee on Registration

Ms. Cynthia Corley gave the first registration report.

Lay Voting Members	233
Rostered Leaders	156
Total Voting Members	389
Visitors	<u>40</u>
Total Attendance	429

Adoption of Agenda

Bishop McCoid asked those speaking in favor of or against a matter before the assembly to do so at the appropriate microphone and noted that they will be limited to three minutes.

The agenda for the assembly was adopted as presented.

2019 MNYS ANNUAL ASSEMBLY

THURSDAY, MAY 16, 2019

8 am – 10:30 am

Registration and Check-In

Grand Ballroom Foyer

9:00 am

Synod Assembly Orientation

Grand Ballroom

10:00 am

Opening of the Assembly

Grand Ballroom

10:15 am – 12:35 pm

PLENARY SESSION I

Grand Ballroom

Welcome, Bishop Donald J. McCoid

Introductions:

Bishop John Macholz, Chaplain

The Rev. C. Anderson James, Parliamentarian

The Rev. Joel Brandt, Reference and Counsel

The Rev. Paul Johnsen, Assembly Planning Coordinator

ELCA Presiding Bishop Elizabeth Eaton, ELCA Representative

Synod Staff

Robert's Rules

Synod Assembly Resources

Introduction to voting devices, Ms. Jean Knight

Registration and Attendance, Ms. Cynthia Corley

Adoption of the Agenda, Bishop Donald J. McCoid

Rules and Procedures, Bishop Donald J. McCoid

Bishop's Election VP

Explanation of 1st Ballot and Voting Procedures, Bishop Elizabeth Eaton

Prayer, Bishop Elizabeth Eaton

1st Ballot for Bishop, Bishop Elizabeth Eaton

Introduction of Synod Officers and Synod Council, Bishop Donald J. McCoid

Synod Council Report, Ms. Renee Wicklund, Vice-President

Report of the Treasurer, Mr. John Litke

Presentation of the Proposed 2019 Revised Budget and 2020 Budget

Mr. Edward Wagner, Chair Financial Management Committee; and Mr. John Litke,
Treasurer

Discussion will be held at the Budget Breakfast, Friday, May 17.

Introduction of the Deans


Anniversaries / Rostered Leaders / Congregations

John Krahn Presentation (Golden Jubilee)
Silver Jubilees
Report of 1st Ballot, Bishop Elizabeth Eaton
Announcements
Prayer, Chaplain

12:35pm – 2:00 pm
Lunch

11:30am – 1:30 pm, and 2:30 pm – 6:15 pm
Registration and Check-In
Grand Ballroom Foyer

2:00 pm – 5:45 pm
PLENARY SESSION II
Grand Ballroom

Call to Order, Bishop Donald J. McCoid
Registration and Attendance, Ms. Cynthia Corley
Prayer, Bishop Elizabeth Eaton
2nd Ballot for Bishop, Bishop Elizabeth Eaton
Bishop's Report, Bishop Donald J. McCoid
Keynote Address (Care for Creation) 
Coffee Break
We Are Church Together, Communications Report
Confronting Racism, The Rev. Becca Seely & The Rev. Marcia Parkinson-Harrison
We Are a Sanctuary Synod, Sanctuary Ministry
Vibrant Congregations, Ms. Hazel Goldstein
Project Redevelopments, Mr. Renato Matos
Ecumenical Greetings
Report of the 2nd Ballot for Bishop
Announcements
Prayer, Chaplain

6:00 pm 7:30 pm
Dinner

7:30pm
Festival Eucharist
Grand Ballroom

FRIDAY, MAY 17, 2019

8 am – 10:30 am
Registration and Check-In


Grand Ballroom Foyer

7:00 am
Budget Breakfast

7:00 am
Hearing Breakfast | Memorial 1

8:30 am
Morning Prayer
Grand Ballroom

9:30 am – 12:00 pm
PLENARY SESSION III
Grand Ballroom

Call to Order, Bishop Donald J. McCoid
Prayer, Chaplain
Registration and Attendance
Nominees for Bishop: Personal Presentations, Bishop Elizabeth Eaton
Top seven nominees plus ties will present 5 minutes each.
Registration and Attendance Report
Prayer, Bishop Elizabeth Eaton
Third Ballot for Bishop, Bishop Elizabeth Eaton
Reference & Council
Environmental Stewardship Committee 
Announcements
Prayer, Chaplain

11 am – 1:00 pm
Registration and Check-In
Grand Ballroom Foyer

12:00 pm – 1:30 pm
Lunch

1:30 pm – 5:30 pm
PLENARY SESSION IV
Grand Ballroom

Call to Order, Bishop Donald McCoid
Prayer, Chaplain
Registration and Attendance Report
Report of the 3rd Ballot
Adoption of Revised 2019/Proposed 2020 Budgets, Mr. John Litke & Mr. Edward Wagner
PINECREST

**Lutheran Ministries in Higher Education
United Lutheran Seminary
In Memoriam**

Hymn

**2:35 pm – 3:10 pm
Coffee Break**

**1:30 pm – 3:00 pm
Registration and Check-In
*Grand Ballroom Foyer***

Questions of Nominees for Bishop, Bishop Elizabeth Eaton
Top three nominees plus ties will answer questions previously submitted.

Registration and Attendance Report

Prayer, Bishop Elizabeth Eaton

4th Ballot for Bishop, Bishop Elizabeth Eaton

Pause

Report of the 4th Ballot for Bishop

Pause

Prayer, Bishop Elizabeth Eaton

5th Ballot for Bishop, Bishop Elizabeth Eaton

Hymn

Report of the 5th Ballot

Acknowledgment of New Bishop Elect

Announcements

Prayer, Chaplain

**5:30 pm – 7:00 pm
Dinner**

**7:00pm – 8:30 pm
Festival Eucharist
*Grand Ballroom***

Bishop McCoid, presiding

The Rev. abby mohaupt, preaching

**8:30 pm
Appreciation Reception | Bishop Donald McCoid**

SATURDAY, MAY 18, 2019

**8 am – 10:30 am
Registration and Check-In
*Grand Ballroom Foyer***

7:30 am
Welcome Breakfast | Bishop Elect

8:30 am
Morning Prayer
Grand Ballroom

9:00 am
Workshops & Forums

11:00 am – 1:30 pm
Registration and Check-In
Grand Ballroom Foyer

10:30 am – 1:30 pm
PLENARY SESSION III
Grand Ballroom

Call to Order, Bishop Donald J. McCoid
Prayer, Chaplain
Final Registration and Attendance
Lutheran Social Services of NY
Evangelical Mission
Congregational Financial Accountancy Task Force
Ecumenical Greetings
Announcements
Closing of the Assembly

12:00 pm – 1:30 pm
Lunch

1:30 pm – 3:00 pm
Closing Eucharist
Grand Ballroom
Bishop-Elect, *presiding*
Bishop McCoid, *preaching*

Adoption of Rules of the Assembly
The Rules were adopted as presented.

Bishop's Election Process
The assembly viewed a video on the election process.
Presiding Bishop Elizabeth Eaton spoke about the role and office of Bishop and then explained the first ballot and voting procedures for the election.

First Ballot for Bishop

Following prayer, ballots were distributed. The voting members voted and the ballots were collected and taken to the Election room for tally.

Introduction of Synod Officers and Synod Council

Bishop McCoid introduced the officers and council to the Assembly.

Ms. Renee Wicklund, Vice President
The Rev. Robert Schoepflin, Secretary
Mr. John Litke, Treasurer
Mr. Leonel Avila, Christ-Cristo, Freeport
Mr. Adam Campbell (Youth Representative), Our Saviour, Mineola
Ms. Cynthia Corley, New Hope, Jamaica (Executive Committee)
The Rev. Chryll Crews, St. Stephen's, Brooklyn
S. Dcn. Stephen Daniels, Trinity, Wyandanch
Mr. David Ehlers, St. John's, Lindenhurst
Ms. Monica Gavryszewski, Lutheran Parish of Northern Dutchess
Ms. Hazel Goldstein, St. John's, Middletown
The Rev. Marva Jenkins, Epiphany, Laurelton
The Rev. Christopher Mietlowski, Gustavus Adolphus, Manhattan
S. Dcn. John Ogren, Gustavus Adolphus, Manhattan
The Rev. Jeanine Owens, Abiding Presence, Bronx (Executive Committee)
The Rev. David Parsons, St. John-St. Matthew-Emanuel, Brooklyn
The Rev. Daniel Peter Penumaka, St. Paul's International, Floral Park (Executive Committee)
S.Dcn. Denise Rutherford-Gill, Jehu's Table, Brooklyn
Mr. Thomas Sargent, St. Paul's, East Northport
The Rev. Nicole Schwalbe, Resurrection, Mount Kisco
Cecil "Chip" Spurlock-Shackelton, Good Shepherd, Roosevelt
The Rev. Gary Squire, Messiah, Staten Island
Ms. Wendy Bean Tannenbaum, St. Paul's, East Northport
Ms. Emma Turner (Young Adult representative), St. Andrews, West Hempstead
Mr. Christopher Vergara, St. Peter's/Sion, Manhattan (Executive Committee)
S. Dcn. Anita Martin-Williams, New Hope, Jamaica
Ms. Karen Wooley, New Hope, Valley Stream

Report of the Vice President

VP Renee Wicklund gave her report to the Assembly. She gave thanks to the members of the Synod Council, and spoke about the numerous committees she has served on, including the committee forming the budget for the Synod. She thanked those who participated in the Town Hall Meetings and spoke about work on the strategic plan for the Synod. The Assembly acknowledged her ministry with applause.

Presentation of Revised 2019 Budget and Proposed 2020 Budget

Mr. Ed Wagner spoke to the members about the 10-Year Plan adopted by the Synod Council. Treasurer John Litke then presented the Revised 2019 Budget and Proposed 2020 Budget.

Bishop McCoid reminded the members that any proposed amendments to the budgets must be submitted by the end of this plenary session.

Revised 2019 and Proposed 2020 Budgets >

Report of the Treasurer

**Edward Wagner, Chair Financial Management Committee and Mr. John Litke,
Treasurer**

This report covers three major topics

- Financial report and auditor's report
- Highlights of current program and budget adjustments
- Longer range financial outlook

Rather than discussing details, I will focus on longer range issues. Details are documented in the bulletin of reports.

The treasurer's job is to ensure that the assets of the synod are managed according to accepted principles and that appropriate techniques are used to ensure the adequacy of controls and reporting of those assets. The financial process is more than just deposits, checks, and recordkeeping, complex though that is. There is also substantial work for planning and analysis to support decision making

The complex work of our financial process is ably managed and executed by Sue Brandt assisted by Regina Daniels, and by the planning and advice of the Financial Management Committee, chaired by Ed Wagner. That committee has been an invaluable voice to alert us to the long term implications of present decisions. More on that later. If any of you are interested in serving on this committee, see Ed or I.

The auditor is asked to confirm that the assets on our books exist, that they are fairly represented and that our revenue and expenses for the past year are correctly stated. The auditor's report in your bulletin of reports is a clean report with no issues and that is a credit to the work of Sue and her team.

Budget Adjustments

Most of the data in the financial reports reflects the day to day work of the synod. One component of our financial operations is our operating expenses, guided by our budget. Our budget process is this: we approve a 2 year budget structure at each synod assembly, one for the current fiscal year and one for next fiscal year. Each such budget is not a fixed contract, but a good faith estimate of what various tasks and programs will require financially. The figures are in the Bulletin of Reports, I am not going to review them in detail; please come to the budget breakfast with your questions.

These financial reports and financial budgets in your packets document what the synod has done in the past year and what the leadership anticipates will or should be done in the next year. Also, change happens, so the 2019 budget you see today is a revised version of the 2019 budget passed last year, reflecting changes that have happened since last year. We are within 2% of the previous 2019 budget bottom line which is pretty good going, Please remember that these financial measures are only a part of the report. The past behavior of each of us in the synod in the past year and our joint and several plans for next year are also part of that report. Would time permit, each and every one of you should present what

you did in response to God's call to diaconal living and what you plan to do - ---and the sum of all your past and future efforts is really the plan/report of the synod. More challenging than the day to day operations, but also rewarding both to our ministry and to our finances, is the development of selected previous congregational sites like the site of the former Zion on 4th Ave in Brooklyn. We engage in some selected developments that both promise new ministry opportunities and will be a net financial return to the synod. These projects are tracked as part of a restricted fund devoted to each project and usually require a substantial up front cost in legal, building, zoning and other professional skills to produce the long term net positive return on our investment.

Strategic Consultant, Legal Assistance Costs

This slide is a summary of the costs of outside professional help as requested by a previous synod assembly. These experts are mostly but not entirely devoted to the various re-development and synod preservation projects and some synod actions that were contested in civil court. Costs are allocated to the projects as appropriate.

Recent Notable Changes to the Synod Activities

Here are some notable changes in our synod activities that are also visible in the financial documents.

Communications costs are higher than we predicted last year although the communication results are excellent. We will reduce that cost next year, but this bishop election year will have higher than previously planned communication and synod assembly costs.

One of the significant costs in the past year was the setting up of the Evangelical Lutheran corporation as a supporting organization for the synod. This structure, now operational, holds title to some of our financial assets and manages them on behalf of the synod. The purpose is to shield much of our major non-property investments from legal liability claims that might be caused by unexpected court judgements while at the same time giving us the ability to use these assets in support of the mission of the synod.

Unexpended funds such as in budget lines for Sower's project and Pastoral Care permitted spending on Immigration ministry, a now very real and present challenge for New York.

Capital Improvement Challenge grants and Building for Mission grants are a bit lower than planned, permitting an intervention to allow Leif Ericson Day School to complete their school year even though enrollment fell below the economic viability point.

Overall financial constraints have already meant that some hoped for pilot projects and partnership grants will not go as we would like.

You will also see that the 2020 proposed budget is beginning to show the effects of a deliberate reduction in spending. That reduction will only get larger in years to come. Discussion of the details of the financial report and budget details is at the budget breakfast, please come, and a budget vote will be on Sat Morning(?).

The near future outlook

Longer term, we are constrained by two major factors at both synod and congregational levels

Constraints

- Limitations of staff and volunteer skills and time
- Limitations of financial resources to support current activities.

Mission support from congregations to the synod used to be more than half of our synod revenue, and the use of investment income used to be less than ¼ of synod revenue.

Today, mission support contributes only one fifth of revenue, and investment income is three times mission support revenue. We are now critically dependent on investment income. How did that come to be? There are two causes: first a resolve to work harder to help congregations reinvigorate and second the steady decline of the congregations of our synod. It became clear about 16 yrs ago that congregational weakening was going to inevitably lead to further reduction in mission support as well as more congregational closures. At that time, we resolved to save the proceeds from the sale of the vacated properties so that we could, via the interest and appreciation on investment, continue to supplement the weakening mission support income and so maintain our usual mission as a synod and our support for congregations.

Not too long after, rather than just using the return on invested assets to substitute for declining mission support, we began spending more of these released assets in congregational renewal projects, under the aegis of the Mission Development Board. At that time we did not have the data, time and analysis to determine if our initial investments in congregational growth and renewal were being effective --we were being hopeful of our commitment to congregation vitality.

About 10 years ago we decided to double down. We increased spending substantially by increased withdrawal from our investment reserves to help congregations revitalize in the intention that overall congregational vitality might increase. This renewed emphasis and increased spending on helping congregations was imagined, organized, and managed in the context of our Strategic Plan. Many new or enhanced initiatives resulted -- summarized here.

Notable Strategic Plan Inspired change

All this and more was in addition to our usual support of the call process, social ministry, campus ministry, and many other items of our community life.

It was clear at that time that such large deficit spending could be only for a relatively short period of time before we must return to living within our income. At the time, we resolved to return to a 'balanced' budget by 2024. Balanced means an income and spending plan that uses no more of our investment assets each year than we can expect to receive in interest and appreciation. That resolve to return to a balanced budget soon means two things:

Implications

- Spending Reductions
- Reassessment of our programs

First, the next few years will see a significant reduction in our spending plans and second, we must begin a sober analysis of what over these last 20 years or so worked, what did not work,

and how we can be most effective in the years to come with a significantly reduced operating budget compared to our experienced needs. The Financial Management Committee has been very helpful by developing financial models to help us see the challenge before us. So I now ask Ed Wagner, chair of the FMC, to show you the trends in actual and projected spending and revenue over a 15 year span, so you can better understand our challenges

Anticipated Revenue

The first graph shows actual and anticipated revenue. Actual data is for the years until 2018, and projected data thereafter. Note that congregational mission support has and continues to decline. Sustainable support from investments was once about 1/3 of overall revenue, and is projected to become about 3/4 of our total income by 2028. This estimate depends upon estimates of our return on investment, market performance and the rate of increase in investment assets from sold buildings. If we withdraw from investments no more than about 4% annually, our remaining investment in inflation adjusted terms will sustain its economic value. This withdrawal rate yields our estimate of sustainable income from investments.

Anticipated Expenses

The second graph shows the actual and planned expenses over the time span according to our current strategy for aggressive reinvestment in congregations. The colors help you see the approximate cost of major sectors of the synod's work. The Blue and Red bars and part of the Brown include the cost of the new renewal efforts. The dark green is our mission support for the ELCA, and the light green is the finance and administration activities of the synod. This plan seriously exceeds sustainable income as will become clear in the next graph. In this plan, the major increases are all in the congregational support categories. Finance and administration is to grow slowly driven primarily by the complexity and costs of managing the properties and assets of closed congregations.

Investment Drawdown Requirements

The third graph shows, in blue, the amounts required to be withdrawn from investments to support this hoped for expense plan. These blue withdrawals are more than we can safely withdraw if we wish to preserve the economic value of our capital. Therefore, we resolved that by 2024 this excess withdrawal should cease and we should thereafter live within our means.

Spending Reduction Implications

The fourth graph has a black line that shows the revenue plan that is sustainable superimposed upon the hoped for spending plan. You can see that we should plan that 2020 spends no more than 2019 and that spending declines until 2024. This means that total spending in the base synod mission programs, the partnership grant programs, and the newer programs developed under our strategic plan must decrease substantially over the next 5 years or so. The orange bars illustrate the approximate reductions, year by year, to achieve this goal compared to our previous spending plans.

Long-term Implications

So, financial constraints in the next few years are clear, including a substantial reduction in operating expenses. We must begin a sober conversation of what over these last 20 years or so worked, what did not work, and how we can be most effective in the years to come.

To help us begin the conversation, it is helpful to look at data from a longer period. Even with the constraints, our goal is and has been congregational vitality -- congregations are an important on the ground witness to the Gospel. How has synod congregational vitality changed as a result of our efforts, particularly in the past decades?

Congregation Count

The number of congregations in the synod has declined by about 25% since 1988

Congregation Revenue

and inflation adjusted revenue for congregations, as an aggregate, has also declined by about 25% in inflation adjusted terms. Average congregations are smaller and poorer even though other data shows that average giving per active member has not declined. Congregations (as does the synod) now depend significantly on rental or other non-giving revenue for a significant fraction of their budget. All of these trends have been constant over the past 30 years, so this is not new news, but it is of concern because we have worked to forestall such changes..

Better Way

So, it is time to assess – are we doing the best we can? I don't propose an answer, this is a genuine question. Note that just because these trends have not changed over the 20 or so years that our synod has been working for improvement --it is not at all clear that we have been ineffective. Indeed it is possible, though not easy to demonstrate, that without our past efforts the picture would be much grimmer.

Still, is there a better way of acting together as synod? This question clearly demands extended conversation in this coming year.

Now here is the good part: though we (and the rest of the ELCA and many US Christian communities) face substantial challenges, we in New York are in a unique pioneering place. We as a synod have a great diversity of people and place. This is a great strength to learn from each other and to depend upon each other. We are grappling with change in every part of our lives- that is both disturbing and exhilarating as we work through the challenges. Metro NY has growth opportunities in urban, suburban and rural areas. And, because of the extraordinary value of our urban properties, we do have the financial assets and investment opportunities to actually do significant new things.

We in Metro NY are pioneers in facing the challenges common in the ELCA today. It is great to be a pioneer, but you know the old saying that pioneers are the ones with arrows in the back – and arrows in the back do hurt.

But if we work together, keeping focused on God's call to us for diaconal living, we can not only ensure a vital ministry of the gospel in our area but we can be an exemplar and encouragement for other parts of our church. So let this be the day we begin an extended conversation about our pioneer future in ministry.

Introduction of Conference of Deans

Dcn. Margy Schmitt Ajer introduced the Conference of Deans.

The Rev. Fernando Otero: Bronx

The Rev. James O'Hanlon: Tappan Zee

The Rev. John Flack: Manhattan

The Rev. Marcia Parkinson Harrison: Southeast Queens

The Rev. Edward Barnett: Southwest Nassau
The Rev. Jeanne Warfield: Western Queens
The Rev. Kevin O’Hara: Peconic
The Rev. Mary Lou Baumgartner: Delaware Hudson
The Rev. Emily Trubey-Weller: Eastern Nassau
The Rev. Sonja Maclary: Hudson
The Rev. Katrina Foster: Brooklyn Bridges
The Rev. Wolfgang Laudert: Staten Island
The Rev. Joanne Bond: Western Suffolk
The Rev. Khader Khalilia: Southwest Brooklyn
The Rev. Robert Cederstrom: Western Nassau
The Rev. Harriet Wieber: South Shore Brooklyn

Recognition of Anniversaries/Rostered Ministers and Congregations

Dcn. Margy Schmitt Ager recognized the following rostered ministers for their years of service and presented them with a certificate and icon.

25 Years Ordained

The Rev. Samuel Cruz
The Rev. Katrina Foster
The Rev. Kimberli Lile
The Rev. Christopher Mietlowski
The Rev. Samuel Silaban

50 Years Ordained

The Rev. Kai Borner
The Rev. John Krahn
The Rev. Harvey von Harten
The Rev. Gerard Gaeta

She then recognized the following congregations celebrating anniversaries, asking members of the congregations to stand.

100 Years of Ministry

St. Paul, Avenue J, Brooklyn

125 Years of Ministry

St. Paul, Liberty
St. Peter’s, 219th Street, Bronx
Zion, Staten Island

150 Years of Ministry

Holy Trinity, Manhattan
St. Luke, New Rochelle
St. Paul, Narrowsburg

Report of the First Ballot for Bishop

Presiding Bishop Eaton announced that there was no election on the first ballot and explained that it was to be deemed the nominating ballot. Pastor Kevin O’Hara read the names of pastors who received votes and that any pastor not wishing to remain in consideration for bishop should pick up a withdrawal form to complete and submit to Secretary Schoepflin at the close of the plenary session. Pastors moving forward to the 2nd ballot were asked to report at the close of the session to the Elections Office to sign a disclosure form and Authorization and Release form for a background check.

The results of the voting on the first (nominating) ballot were as follows:

The Rev. Christopher Mietlowski	53
The Rev. Katrina Foster	36
The Rev. Jonathan Linman	34
The Rev. A. David Anglada	30
The Rev. Paul Egensteiner	29
The Rev. William Baum	26
The Rev. Edward Barnett	18
The Rev. Percy Butiku	15
The Rev. Heidi Neumark	13
The Rev. Harry Schenkel	11
The Rev. Lamont Anthony Wells	9
The Rev. Harvard Stephens	8
The Rev. Robert Cederstrom	4
The Rev. Robert Schoepflin	4
The Rev. J. Elise Brown	3
The Rev. Amandus Derr	3
The Rev. Khader Khalilia	3
The Rev. Sonja Maclary	3
The Rev. Marcia Parkinson-Harrison	3
The Rev. Nicole Schwalbe	3
The Rev. Garry Squire	3
The Rev. Jerome Taylor	3
The Rev. Brenda Irving	2
The Rev. Justin Lathrop	2
The Rev. James O'Hanlon	2
The Rev. Jonathan Recabarren-Almonte	2
The Rev. James Watrud	2
The Rev. Tobias Anderson	1
The Rev. Eduardo Fabian Arias	1
The Rev. Paul Block	1
The Rev. Joanne Bond	1
The Rev. Chryll Crews	1
The Rev. George Dietrich	1
The Rev. Mark Erson	1
The Rev. John Havrilla	1
The Rev. Richard Hill	1
The Rev. Timothy Kennedy	1
The Rev. James Klockau	1
The Rev. Kathleen Koran	1
The Rev. Joseph Mantovani	1
The Rev. Danielle Miller	1
The Rev. I. Daniel Penumaka	1
The Rev. Michael Poole	1
The Rev. Brenda Smith	1
The Rev. Micah Stumme	1
The Rev. Emily Trubey-Weller	1

The Rev. Kevin Vandiver	1
The Rev. Jeanne Warfield	1
The Rev. Robert Wollenburg	1
The Rev. Lee Miller	1
The Rev. Albert W. Triolo	1
The Rev. Leila Ortiz	1
The Rev. Stephen P. Bouman	1
The Rev. Wyvetta Bullock	1
The Rev. Craig M. Mueller	1

Announcements

Ms. Elizabeth Hoffman made announcements, reminding voting members that resolutions and memorials to be brought before the assembly must be submitted at the close of the session, and that voting members should be seated for the start of the second plenary session at 2:00 pm.

Assembly Chaplain, Bishop John Macholz, closed the session with prayer.

THURSDAY, MAY 16, 2019

PLENARY SESSION II

Bishop McCoid opened the second plenary session with prayer at 2:05 pm.

Report of the Committee on Registration

Ms. Cynthia Corley gave the second registration report.

Lay Voting Members	252
Rostered Leaders	180
Total Voting Members	432
Visitors	<u>48</u>
Total Attendance	480

Second Ballot for Bishop

Presiding Bishop Eaton announced the start of the second ballot, asking all voting members to be seated and noting that there would be no entry or exit from the ballroom until all ballots have been collected. All pastors nominated on the first ballot who did not withdraw would appear on the second ballot.

Following prayer, ballots were distributed. The voting members voted and the ballots were collected and taken to the Election room for tally.

Bishop’s Report

In his report Bishop McCoid spoke about the time he spent as Interim Bishop. It was a time of listening, learning and healing. He called upon the Synod to pray for, support, and be patient with the bishop who will be elected. He acknowledged the work of Synod staff,

officers, council members and committee members and noted the many resources that the Synod had in the gifts of its members. In closing he spoke warm words about his call as Interim Bishop and said that his love and prayers will continue to be with us. The assembly acknowledged his ministry with applause and acclamation.’

Keynote Address: The Rev. abby mohaubt

Rev. mohaubt gave the keynote address, Climate Change, Faith and Human Vocation, in keeping with the Assembly theme of Care for Creation. She emphasized our responsibility as people of God to work on fixing creation and the systems that have resulted in climate change.

We are Church Together

Roberto Lara, Director of Communications and Pr. Mark Erson, Chairperson of Claimed Committee gave a presentation on communications.

Confronting Racism

Pr. Marcia Parkinson-Harrison and Pr. Becca Seely spoke to the Assembly about the importance of confronting racism in our church and in society.

We Are A Sanctuary Synod

Pr. Fabian Arias and Mr. Christopher Vergara addressed Assembly about the work of the Sanctuary Ministry Team, and issues surrounding immigrants.

Vibrant Congregations

Ms. Hazel Goldstein spoke about the work of the Gathered Committee and the grants that have been given to congregations and individuals.

Project Redevelopments

Bishop McCoid invited Joseph Milano, Renato Matos, and Peter Sanders, of Capell, Barnett, Matalon & Schoenfeld, Esqs. to report on Mission Driven Development projects. Mr. Matos gave specifics on several of the excited projects underway.

Report of the Second Ballot for Bishop

Presiding Bishop Eaton asked Pr. Kevin O’Hara to announce the results. He indicated that 424 ballots were cast. There was no election.

The results of the voting on the second ballot were as follows:

The Rev. Christopher Mietlowski	82
The Rev. Katrina Foster	54
The Rev. Jonathan Linman	46
The Rev. Paul Egensteiner	41
The Rev. Edward Barnett	39
The Rev. A. David Anglada	37
The Rev. William Baum	34
The Rev. Edward Barnett	18
The. Rev, Heidi Neumark	29

The Rev. Percy Butiku	14
The Rev. Harry Schenkel	10
The Rev. Lamont Anthony Wells	8
The Rev. Jerome Taylor	5
The Rev. Robert Wollenburg	5
The Rev. Leila Ortiz	5
The Rev. Gary Squire	3
The Rev. Paul Block	3
The Rev. Sonja Maclary	2
The Rev. James Watrud	2
The Rev. Lee Miller	1
The Rev. Brenda Smith	0
The Rev. Albert Triolo	0
The Rev. Wyvetta Bullock	0

Presiding Bishop Eaton announced that the top seven candidates - The Rev. Christopher Mietlowski, The Rev. Katrina Foster, The Rev. Jonathan Linman, The Rev. Paul Egensteiner, The Rev. Edward Barnett, The Rev. A. David Anglada, and The Rev. William Baum – will appear on the third ballot on Friday. Each candidate will have the opportunity to address the Assembly for five minutes.

Announcements

Ms. Liz Hoffmann gave announcements, after which Bishop Macholz closed the session with prayer.

Festival Eucharist was held at 7:30 pm.

FRIDAY, MAY 17, 2019

PLENARY SESSION III

After breakfast forums and Morning Prayer, Bishop McCoid opened the third plenary session at 9:30am by inviting Bishop Macholz to begin the session with prayer.

Report of the Committee on Registration

Ms. Cynthia Corley gave the third registration report.

Lay Voting Members	268
Rostered Leaders	193
Total Voting Members	461
Visitors	<u>49</u>
Total Attendance\	510

ELCA Churchwide Report

Presiding Bishop Eaton gave the Churchwide report to the Assembly, noting what will be considered at the Churchwide Assembly later in 2019, including the elections that will take place for Presiding Bishop, Secretary and Church Council positions and social statements that will be considered. A video presentation was then given on the work of the ELCA.

Presiding Bishop Eaton also noted that the Churchwide Assembly will celebrate the 50th anniversary of the ordination of women, the 40th anniversary of the ordination of the first woman of color, and the 10th anniversary of opening the church to LGBTQAI clergy.

Nominees for Bishop/Candidate Statements

Presiding Bishop Eaton invited each of the seven nominated candidates to present a five-minute personal statement to the Assembly. The Rev. Christopher Mietlowski, The Rev. A. David Anglade, The Rev. Paul Egensteiner, The Rev. Edward Barnett, The Rev. William Baum, The Rev. Katrina Foster, and The Rev. Jonathan Linman each addressed the Assembly.

Third Ballot for Bishop

Presiding Bishop Eaton announced the start of the third ballot, asking all voting members to be seated and noting that there would be no entry or exit from the ballroom until all ballots have been collected.

Following prayer, ballots were distributed. The voting members voted and the ballots were collected and taken to the Election room for tally.

Reference and Counsel – Memorial to the Churchwide Assembly

Bishop McCoid asked the Voting Members to activate their Quizdom voting devices.

He then invited Pastor Joel Brandt, Chair of Reference and Counsel to the podium.

Pr. Brandt brought Memorial Number One before the Assembly, noting that it comes before the Assembly from the Synod Council, which adopted the resolution in 2017. He then read the resolves of Synod Council resolution SC17:06/06, noting that the Committee recommended adoption of the memorial:

RESOLVED that Sanctuary not only means the provision of shelter but is a
RESPONSE to raids, detentions, deportations, and the criminalization of immigrants and refugees, a
STRATEGY to fight individual cases of deportation, to advocate for an end of mass detention and amplify immigrant voices, a
VISION for what our communities and world can be, and a
MORAL IMPERATIVE to take prophetic action of radical hospitality rooted in the ancient traditions of our faith communities;

RESOLVED that the Metropolitan New York Synod declare itself one of the first major metropolitan Sanctuary Synods of the ELCA ready to help protect refugees and undocumented people from arrest and deportation by Immigration and Customs Enforcement officers (ICE), in partnership with organizations like Lutheran Immigration and Refugee Services, The New Sanctuary Coalition, The New York Immigration Coalition, New York Legal Aid Society, and the ELCA's AMMPARO program by:

Developing a network of Sanctuary Congregations
Coordinating accompaniment trainings – being silent advocates during check-ins or hearings

Creating a plan for awareness building around issues of immigration and refugees
Advocating for just immigration policies including fairness in admitting and protecting refugees; and be it further

RESOLVED that the Metropolitan New York Synod endorse, fully support, & help train congregations seeking to be Sanctuary Congregations, creating a network of sanctuary in our synod, whose work would include but not be limited to:

- Help congregations explore why and how to identify themselves as Sanctuary Congregations
- Reaching out to nearby immigrant congregations or communities
- Expand or Redevelop existing programs with a focus on reaching out to immigrants and refugees
- Create and distribute “Know Your Rights Cards” to undocumented persons
- Reach out and network with other Sanctuary Congregations to share support and information
- Provide short term respite sanctuary during immediate crisis
- Train in and participate in accompaniment program
- Participate in the ELCA’s AAMPARO program for unaccompanied minors.
- Encourage participation in Jericho Walks around Federal Plaza
- Host Immigration Consultations with legal professionals for immigrants; and be it further

RESOLVED, that the Metropolitan New York Synod memorialize the 2019 ELCA Churchwide Assembly to adopt a similar resolution for the whole Evangelical Lutheran Church in America.

Upon motion made and seconded, the Assembly voted to approve the memorial

ACTION SA2019:0.01

RESOLVED, that the Metropolitan New York Synod memorialize the 2019 ELCA Churchwide Assembly to adopt a similar resolution for the whole Evangelical Lutheran Church in America.

ADOPTED

Pastor Brandt then presented Resolution Number One on the Poor Peoples’ Campaign.

RESOLVED that the Metropolitan New York Synod endorse the Poor People’s Campaign and encourage its members to participate where appropriate in the organizing, advocacy, and actions of the campaign.

Pr. Brandt announced that Assembly needed to vote to consider the resolution since it was presented after the deadline for presentation of resolutions.

Upon motion made and seconded to consider the Resolution, the motion carried to consider the resolution.

The Rev. Lenny Duncan spoke in favor of the resolution.

The Rev. Amandus Derr noted that if this resolution would be a memorial to Churchwide, an amendment would need to be made.

After discussion, vote on the original resolution was taken.

ACTION SA 2019:05.02

RESOLVED that the Metropolitan New York Synod endorse the Poor People's Campaign and encourage its members to participate where appropriate in the organizing, advocacy, and actions of the campaign.

ADOPTED.

Pr. Brandt then welcomed a motion to memorialize the Churchwide Assembly. Pr. Derr made the following motion:

RESOLVED that the Metropolitan New York Synod memorialize the 2019 ELCA Churchwide Assembly to endorse the Poor People's Campaign and encourage its synods and congregations to participate where appropriate in the organizing, advocacy, and actions of the campaign.

Upon motion made and seconded, the resolution was adopted.

ACTION SA 2019:05.03

RESOLVED that the Metropolitan New York Synod memorialize the 2019 ELCA Churchwide Assembly to endorse the Poor People's Campaign and encourage its synods and congregations to participate where appropriate in the organizing, advocacy, and actions of the campaign.

ADOPTED

Pr. Brandt asked Bishop McCoid to hand the chair to Vice President Renee Wicklund.

Upon assuming the chair, VP Wicklund invited Pastor John Jurik to present the following resolution to the Assembly:

WHEREAS, the Metropolitan New York Synod in February 2018 found itself in a time of special need; and

WHEREAS, The Rev. Donald J. McCoid selflessly offered his time and his experience to serve the Metropolitan New York Synod as its Interim Bishop until the election of a new Bishop; and

WHEREAS, The Rev. Donald J. McCoid has performed the office of Interim Bishop competently and skillfully, and has provided a pastoral presence for the members of the Metropolitan New York Synod; therefore

BE IT RESOLVED, that the Metropolitan New York Synod expresses its heartfelt gratitude and appreciation for The Rev. Donald J. McCoid and his willingness to serve this Synod during its time of special need; and be it further

RESOLVED, that the Metropolitan New York Synod upholds The Rev. Donald J. McCoid's life of ministry.

VP Wicklund then invited Presiding Bishop Eaton to address the Assembly about the appointment of Bishop McCoid as Interim Bishop. She spoke of his strengths and gifts in Metropolitan New York and across the church.

After the question was called, a voice vote was called and the resolution heartily adopted.

ACTION SA 2019:05.04

RESOLVED, that the Metropolitan New York Synod expresses its heartfelt gratitude and appreciation for The Rev. Donald J. McCoid and his willingness to serve this Synod during its time of special need; and be it further

RESOLVED, that the Metropolitan New York Synod upholds The Rev. Donald J. McCoid’s life of ministry.

ADOPTED

Ms. Sandy McCoid was then asked to come to the podium to be with her husband. A plaque with the resolution was presented to Bishop McCoid and flowers to Ms. McCoid. After much acclamation for Bishop’s ministry by the Assembly, Bishop McCoid resumed the chair with warm words of thanks,

Environmental Stewardship Committee

Pastor John Flack, chair of the Synod Stewardship Committee, and Pat Almonrode reported to the Assembly on the work of the Stewardship Committee.

Report of the Third Ballot for Bishop

Presiding Bishop Eaton asked Pr. Kevin O’Hara to announce the results. He indicated that 450 ballots were cast, with 2 invalid ballots. There was no election.

The results of the voting on the third ballot were as follows:

The Rev. Christopher Mietlowski	110
The Rev. Katrina Foster	99
The Rev. Paul Egensteiner	82
The Rev. Jonathan Linman	47
The Rev. William Baum	39
The Rev. A. David Anglada	37
The Rev. Edward Barnett	36

Presiding Bishop Eaton announced that the top three candidates - The Rev. Christopher Mietlowski, The Rev. Katrina Foster, and The Rev. Paul Egensteiner – will appear on the fourth ballot. Prior to the ballot, each candidate will respond to questions that have been submitted.

After announcements by Ms. Elizabeth Hoffmann and prayer by Bishop Macholz, the session was adjourned.

Bishop McCoid called the session to order at 1:30 pm.

Report of the Committee on Registration

Ms. Cynthia Corley gave the fourth registration report.

Lay Voting Members	254
Rostered Leaders	193
Total Voting Members	447
Visitors	<u>50</u>
Total Attendance	494

Adoption of Revised 2019 Budget and Proposed 2020 Budget

SA 2019.05.05	Ratified an Adjusted Budget of \$5,452,620 for F.Y. 2019
SA 2019.05.06	Adopted a Budget of \$5,394,358 for F.Y. 2020

Bishop McCoid welcomed Bishop Derek Lecakes and Vice President Dione Taylor of the Atlantic District-Missouri Synod.

He then invited Presiding Bishop Eaton to preside over the questions to the remaining three candidates for bishop. Lots were drawn for the order of candidates. Presiding Bishop Eaton noted that the questions were submitted by members of the Synod and from listening post meetings.

The order of candidates in answering questions was rotated and ninety seconds was allowed to each candidate to respond.

Fourth Ballot for Bishop

Presiding Bishop Eaton announced the start of the fourth ballot, asking all voting members to be seated and noting that there would be no entry or exit from the ballroom until all ballots have been collected.

Following prayer, ballots were distributed. The voting members voted and the ballots were collected and taken to the Election room for tally.

Presiding Bishop Eaton announced a discrepancy in the voting credential number. Voting members who had returned their voting instruments were told to re-register.

Bishop Mc Coid then asked Ms. Cynthia Corley to present another registration report.

Report of the Committee on Registration

Ms. Cynthia Corley gave the fifth registration report.

Lay Voting Members	268
--------------------	-----

Rostered Leaders	193
Total Voting Members	461
Visitors	<u>49</u>
Total Attendance	510

(Second) Fourth Ballot for Bishop

Presiding Bishop Eaton announced the start of the (second) fourth ballot, asking all voting members to be seated and noting that there would be no entry or exit from the ballroom until all ballots have been collected.

Ballots were distributed. After prayer, the voting members voted and the ballots were collected and taken to the Election room for tally.

Bishop McCoid announced that dinner will be pushed back and that a fifth ballot, if necessary will take place during this session.

Report of the Fourth Ballot for Bishop

Presiding Bishop Eaton asked Pr. Kevin O’Hara to announce the results. He indicated that 451 ballots were cast, with 0 invalid ballots. There was no election.

The results of the voting on the fourth ballot were as follows:

The Rev. Paul Egensteiner	160
The Rev. Christopher Meitlowski	149
The Rev. Katrina Foster	142

Presiding Bishop Eaton announced that two candidates - The Rev. Paul Egensteiner and the Rev. Christopher Meitlowski – will appear on the fifth ballot. A majority vote will determine the next bishop.

Presiding Bishop Eaton announced the start of the fifth ballot, asking all voting members to be seated and noting that there would be no entry or exit from the ballroom until all ballots have been collected.

Ballots were distributed. After prayer, the voting members voted and the ballots were collected and taken to the Election room for tally.

Bishop McCoid announced that the installation of the new bishop will be November 16 at the Cathedral Church of St. John the Divine.

The Assembly joined in singing “Blessed Assurance” and “Amazing Grace” while awaiting the results of the fifth ballot for bishop.

Report of the Fifth Ballot for Bishop

Presiding Bishop Eaton asked Pr. Kevin O’Hara to announce the results. He indicated that 450 ballots were cast, with 2 invalid ballots. We have a Bishop!

The results of the voting on the fourth ballot were as follows:

The Rev. Paul Egensteiner	250
The Rev. Christopher Meitlowski	198

Bishop McCoid asked Pr. Egensteiner to come to the podium. Presiding Bishop Eaton declared Paul Egensteiner to have been elected Bishop of Metropolitan New York Synod. The Assembly received him joyfully with applause.

ACTION SA 2019:05.07 Election of Bishop

Bishop Paul Egensteiner

After announcements by Ms. Elizabeth Hoffmann and prayer by Bishop Macholz, the session was adjourned.

After dinner and the Festival Eucharist, a reception to honor and thank Bishop McCoid was held. A gift was presented to Bishop and Mrs. McCoid by the Synod.

SATURDAY, MAY 18, 2019

PLENARY SESSION V

Bishop McCoid called the session to order at 10:30 am and asked Bishop Macholz to pray. Bishop McCoid led the Assembly in thanking Bishop Macholz for serving as Assembly Chaplain.

Report of the Committee on Registration

Ms. Cynthia Corley gave the sixth registration report.

Lay Voting Members	268
Rostered Leaders	193
Total Voting Members	461
Visitors	<u>49</u>
Total Attendance	510

Bishop McCoid led the Assembly in thanking Cynthia Corley for her work on registration.

Lutheran Social Services New York

Dr. Damyn Kelly, President & CEO of LSSNY greeted the voting members and reported on the work of LSSNY.

Evangelical Mission

Mr. Branden Dupree, Interim Director of Evangelical Mission was welcomed by Bishop McCoid and the Assembly as Interim DEM. He spoke of the work he is doing, along with churchwide on congregational vitality. He presented a video in which the former DEM, The Rev. Lamont Wells, along with Mr. Dupree, Pr. Heidi Neumark and Pr. Gladys Diaz, spoke of the work God is doing in Metropolitan New York.

Congregational Financial Accountancy Task Force

Pr. Edward Barnett, Chairperson of this task force, the formation of which was mandated by resolution of the 2018 Synod Assembly, reported that the work of the task force is not yet complete and asked that its report be deferred until the next Assembly.

Ecumenical Greetings

The Rev. Dr. Brian E. McWeeney, Director of Ecumenical and Interfaith Affairs, Ethnic Apostolates, and Ecclesial Ministries and Organizations for the Archdiocese of New York brought greetings from our Roman Catholic sisters and brothers, and spoke of the work we all have to do in the name of Jesus Christ to build relationships with persons of other denominations and faiths and work together on social concerns and ministry.

The Rev. Derek G. Lecakes, Bishop of the Atlantic District, brought greetings from the Lutheran Church-Missouri Synod. He welcomed Pr. Egensteiner as our new bishop and spoke of the importance of speaking with each other and working together.

The Rt. Rev. R. William Franklin, Assisting Bishop, Episcopal Diocese of Long Island, brought greetings, noting that we have been in full communion for twenty years. He said that the Anglican Church of Canada and the Evangelical Lutheran Church of Canada may soon be brought into full communion, enabling us to reach across borders to cooperate in ministry.

The Rt. Rev. Alan Shin, Bishop Suffragan of the Episcopal Diocese of New York brought greetings.

Bishop McCoid thanked the voting members of the Assembly and all who worked to make the Assembly and the election process go so well. He thanked all the members of the Synod for the gift he was presented the night before. The Assembly thanked Bishop McCoid for his ministry with a standing ovation.

Liz Hoffmann gave final announcements and thanked all the members of the Assembly Planning Committee.

The session was adjourned at 12:30 pm.

Following lunch, the final Eucharist, with rite for Closing of the Assembly, was held at 1:30 pm.

*Respectfully submitted,
Rev. Robert Schoepflin
Secretary, MNYS*