

**SYNOD COUNCIL MEMBERS**

**\*The Rev. William Baum** 2016  
*The Rev. Rosalind Brathwaite* 2016  
*Ms. Christine Connell, DM* 2014  
**\*Ms. Maria del Toro, Vice President** 2014  
**The Rev. Khader El-Yateem** 2016  
**Dcn Charles Germain** 2014  
**Ms. Barbara Hansen** 2014  
**The Rev. Marc Herbst** 2014  
**Mr. Eugene Hiigel** 2014  
**The Rev. Brenda Jack** 2016  
**\*Ms. Barbara Johnson** 2016  
**Ms. Savanah Lochansingh, Youth** 2014  
**Dr. Carlos Lopez** 2014  
**Dcn. John Malone** 2014  
**\*Ms. Minerva Melendez** 2014  
**\*The Rev. Paul Milholland** 2014  
**The Rev. Craig Miller** 2014  
**Dcn. John Prosen** 2016  
**Mr. Brian Reardon** 2016  
**\*The Rev. Robert A. Rimbo, Bishop** 2014  
**The Rev. Kit Robison** 2014  
**Ms. Terra Rowe** 2016  
**\*The Rev. Robert Schoepflin, Sect.** 2014  
**Ms. Abby Triebel, Young Adult** 2016  
**\*Mr. Frank Suttell, Treas** 2016  
**Mr. Christopher Vergara** 2016  
**Ms. Karen Woolley** 2016

**AUXILLIARY MEMBERS**

**STAFF**

**The Rev. Percy Butiku**  
*Ms. Sarah Gioe*  
**The Rev. Jack Horner**  
**The Rev. Kathleen Koran**  
**The Rev. Jonathan Linman**  
**Dcn. Gayle Ruege**  
**Ms. Kathleen Schmidt**  
**Ms. Rebekah Wedge**

**GUESTS**

**Ms. Emily Scott, Claimed Strategy Chair**

**Bold = present**  
*Italics = excused absence*  
\*Member of Executive Committee

---

**Devotions:** *Rev. Jonathan Linman*

**Observer:** *Ms. Minerva Melendez*

**Call to Order and Welcome of newly appointed Synod Council Member:** Rev. Marc Herbst  
At 10:05am by VP Maria Del Toro

1. **Adoption of Agenda:** adopted as presented.

2. **Adoption of Minutes: 12 June 2012:** adopted as presented.

3. **Strategic Plan**

A. SENT Strategy Committee chair nomination: Ms. Barbara Johnson

**ACTION SC12:09/01**

**RESOLVED**, that Ms. Barbara Johnson is appointed chairperson of the SENT Strategy Committee.

**ADOPTED**

B. Committee Charges

VP Del Toro asked each Strategy Committee Chair to present their committee charges.

- i. Ms. Emily Scott, chair of the CLAIMED Strategy Committee presented her committee's charge to the SC. Questions and discussion followed.
- ii. Rev. William Baum, chair of the GATHERED Strategy Committee presented his committee's charge. Questions and discussion followed.
- iii. Ms. Barbara Johnson, chair of the SENT Strategy Committee presented her committee's charge. Questions and discussion followed.

VP Del Toro brought the SC into the committee as a whole to discuss the Strategic Committee Charges. It was noted that the charges are intended to be "fluid" and adjusted as needs and the Holy Spirit dictate. Bp. Rimbo, in response to question, indicated that the Bishop and the Office of the Bishop (which includes all of the staff) needs to be the primary voice and advocate for the strategic plan. Dcn Germain noted that the composition of the committees should include 10% youth and young adults, as provided in synod constitution.

VP Del Toro asked Bp Rimbo to lead council in prayer prior to the vote on the Strategic Committee Charges. Then the resolution was presented and voted upon.

**ACTION SC12:09/02**

**RESOLVED**, that the Strategic Committee Charges, as presented, be affirmed, and that the Committee Chairs and members, together with the Executive Committee, be directed to address the concerns and issues raised by the Synod Council members in its discussion of the Charges. **Exhibit A.**

**ADOPTED, unanimously.**

C. Committee members application process

VP Del Toro noted the number of applications received and that Strategic Committee Chairs are speaking to the applicants and contacting other persons in order to insure that the committees are representative of our synod.

Bp Rimbo asked SC members to help identify persons to serve on the committees.

D. MNYS Committee Structure (re-alignment )

VP Del Toro indicated that no decision has been made with regard to standing committees and noted that each of them will fall under one of the Strategy Committees.

A tentative assignment chart was presented. **Exhibit B.**

C. Communication (website, conference visits, etc.)

Bp Rimbo noted that he, Emily Scott, Rebekah Wedge and Sarah Gioe have met with Tom Massey to plan how work of Strategic Committees will be communicated.

#### 4. Bishop's Report

##### A. Staff

2012 a. Rebekah Wedge, Administrator for the Executive Staff effective August 1,

b. Exec. Staff reports **Exhibit C**.

Rev. Jack Horner presented his report verbally and was congratulated for successfully scaling Mt. Kilimanjaro.

##### B. Legal updates

a. First, Jeffersonville

K. Schmidt reported on lowering of price to encourage sale.

b. St. Luke's, Bronx

K. Schmidt reported on agreement for sale of property.

c. Tillinghast suit

K. Schmidt reported on current stage of lawsuit.

d. Estate beneficiary notification

K. Schmidt reported that synod received notice of being a beneficiary of estate.

##### C. Calls:

\* Rev. Martin Mahl Zahn: *Associate Director of Earl Hall/Asst Univ Chaplain, Columbia Univ*

\* Rev. Robert Wollenburg: *Executive Director for Major and Planned Gifts, LSSNY*

\* Rev. William Eggers: *Interim Pastor, Our Saviour's Atonement, Manhattan*

\* Rev. Carol Kessler: *Staff Psychiatrist, Astor Services for Children & Families / Catholic*

*Charities*

\* Rev. Jon Overvold: *Director of System Chaplaincy Services for the North Shore – LIJ*

*Health System*

\* Rev. Kimberli Lile: *Staff Chaplain, North Shore Univ Hospital, Manhasset/NS-LIJ Health*

*System*

\* Rev. Romeo Dabee: *Chaplain, Christ for the World Chapel, JFK Int'l Airport*

\* Rev. Dr. Gary Mills: *On Leave from Call status effective July 1, 2012*

\* Rev. Rebecka Fetters: *On Leave from Call status (family) effective July 15, 2012*

\* Dcn. John Prosen: *On Leave from Call status effective Jan 30, 2012*

\* Rev. Harry Schenkel: *On Leave from Call status effective August 1, 2012*

\* Ms. Sarah Geddada: *removal from the roster effective June 20, 2012*

\* Sr. Cecilia Wilson: *removal from the roster effective August 1, 2012*

#### ACTION SC12:09/03

**RESOLVED**, that calls be extended to Rev. Martin Mahl Zahn, as Associate Director for Earl Hall/Asst. University Chaplain at Columbia University, to Rev. Robert Wollenburg, as Executive Director for Major and Planned Gifts, LSSNY, to Rev. William Eggers, as Intermin Pastor, Our Saviour's Atonement, Manhattan, to Rev. Carol Kessler, as Staff Psychiatrist of Astor Services for Children & Families/Catholic Charities, to Rev. Jon Overvold, as Director of System Chaplaincy Services for the North Shore/LIJ Health System, to Rev. Kimberli Lile, as Staff Chaplain, North Shore/LIJ Health System,

and to Rev. Romeo Dabee, as Chaplain of Christ for the World Chapel, JFK Int'l Airport.

**ADOPTED**

**ACTION SC12:09/04**

**RESOLVED**, that on leave from call status be granted to Rev. Dr. Gary Mills, effective July 1, 2012, to Rev. Rebecka Fetters, effective July 15, 2012, to Dcn. John Prosen effective January 30, 2012, and to Rev. Harry Schenkel, effective August 1, 2012.

**ADOPTED**

Bp Rimbo announced that Sarah Geddada and Cecilia Wilson have been removed from the roster by action of the Conference of Bishops.

D. Appointments:

- a. Assembly Planning Committee: effective July 10, 2012
  - Rev. Paul Johnsen
  - Rev. Paul Milholland
  - Rev. Rebecca Pollicino
  - Rev. Stephanie Pope

Bp Rimbo announced that he has made these appointment.

- b. Candidacy Committee
  - Rev. Mark Erson
  - Rev. Elise Brown

**ACTION SC12:09/05**

**RESOLVED**, that Rev. Mark Erson and Rev. Elise Brown be appointed to the Candidacy Committee.

**ADOPTED**

- E. Invitation for Extended Service: Rev. Deborah DeWinter / First, Poughkeepsie  
Bp. Rimbo noted that Rev. De Winter is a pastor of the UCC.

**ACTION SC12:09/06**

**RESOLVED**, that the Invitation for Extended Service to Rev. Deborah De Winter, to serve at First, Poughkeepsie, be approved..

**ADOPTED**

F. Romania Companionship

Pr. Jack Horner reported on status of our relationship with our companion church in Romania.

Pr. Perucy Butiku reported on current status of relationship with our companion synod in Tanzania.

- G. 2013 Synod Assembly update

Bp Rimbo reported that committee, rather than staff, is developing agenda and other items for synod assembly.

H. Trexler Grant: Rev. John Backe

**ACTION SC12:09/07**

**RESOLVED**, that a Trexler grant in the amount of \$1,000 be approved for Rev. John Backe, for study in Jerusalem.

**ADOPTED**

- I. Christ Chinese, Brooklyn / Holy Trinity, New Rochelle: Letters from ELCA  
Pr. Jack Horner reported on letters that the ELCA has sent to these congregations regarding partnership grants that had been made to these congregations.

**5. Treasurer's Report**

Mr. F. Suttell presented the report of the treasurer. **Exhibit D.**

- A. FMC  
F. Suttell reported on the working of the Financial Management Committee.
- B. Signatories authorization  
F. Suttell reported on need to change signatories on synod accounts.

**ACTION SC12:09/08**

**RESOLVED**, that Robert Buescher and Gary Mills be removed as authorized signatories on the synod's accounts with HSBC Bank and the ELCA Foundation and that Frank Suttell and Rebekah Wedge be added as authorized signatories for the HSBC account and that Frank Suttell and Kathleen Koran be added as authorized signatories for the synod's account with the ELCA Foundation.

**ADOPTED**

**ACTION SC12:09/09**

**RESOLVED**, that Bishop Robert A. Rimbo be authorized to sign the Met Life Annuity claim form for the estate of Milton Werner.

**ADOPTED**

**6. Constitutions**

- A. St. John's, Poughkeepsie: received. No action required.
- B. Gustavus Adolphus, Manhattan: being reviewed
- C. St. Paul's, Liberty: being reviewed
- D. Seafarers & International House: SC ratified new bylaws adopted by the SIH Board of Directors after review by ELCA Office of the Secretary and Bp Rimbo.
- E. St. Peter's, Springfield Gardens: approved.

**7. Old Business**

- A. Manhattan Latino Strategy update  
Pr. Jack Horner reported that progress has been made on this ministry. Zion will worship at St. Peters and combine with the Latino ministry of St. Peters, pending approval of the councils of both congregations.

- B. Congregations under synod administration (*monthly report*) **Exhibit E.**  
Ms. Kathleen Schmidt reported.
- C. Congregational Loan Status / Synod Properties update (*monthly report*) **Exhibit F.**  
Ms. Kathleen Schmidt reported.
- D. Pending
  - a. Zion/Sion, 119<sup>th</sup> Street, Harlem property
  - c. Working Group for Racial and Ethnic Awareness and Sensitivity
  - d. Office Space Task
  - e. Grace, North Branch

Pr. William Baum presented the following resolution denying permission for Grace, North Branch to leave the ELCA and the MNYS:

1. WHEREAS, the Evangelical Lutheran Church in America (the “ELCA”), the successor by merger of The Lutheran Church in America and two other church bodies, is the national church which has jurisdiction and provides religious and mission services to approximately four million five hundred thousand American Lutherans, and is divided into 65 synods in nine geographic regions in the United States, which coordinate the work of the Church’s approximately 10,000 Congregations; and

2. WHEREAS, the Metropolitan New York Synod of the Evangelical Lutheran Church in America (the “Synod”) is the local expression of the larger church body, the ELCA, and is the synod which bears primary responsibility for the oversight of the life and mission of more than 200 Lutheran churches in New York City, Long Island and Westchester, Putnam, Dutchess, Rockland, Orange, Sullivan and Ulster Counties, which are member congregations of the ELCA, including Grace Evangelical Lutheran Church, North Branch, New York; and

3. WHEREAS, Grace Evangelical Lutheran Church, a New York religious corporation located at 999 State Route 95, North Branch, New York 12766, was a congregation of the former Lutheran Church in America, and is an interdependent member congregation of the ELCA (“rostered member”), and the Synod; and

4. WHEREAS, the Constitution of the ELCA, recites that we are one church body organized in three expressions -- each expression has its particular functions but all three together share a common mission. Together, we ensure a strong foundation of leadership that enables faithful gathering and gospel proclamation, community involvement, open dialogue and a culture of support for our members; and

5. WHEREAS, the Constitutions, Bylaws, and Continuing Resolutions of the ELCA and the Synod recognize that the ELCA, the Synod and its congregations are interdependent units that share responsibly in the religious and mission services of the Church; and

6. WHEREAS, the Constitutions, Bylaws, and Continuing Resolutions of the ELCA reflect both the underlying theology of this church as well as its organizational

principles and governance structures. They are both ecclesial and legal documents. Thus, they commit this church in each of its expressions—congregations, synods, and the churchwide organization—to the centrality of proclaiming the Gospel of Jesus Christ, carrying out Christ’s Great Commission, serving the neighbor in response to God’s love, worshipping God, nurturing members in the Word of God, and manifesting the unity given to God’s people in living together in Christ. At the same time, these governing documents also provide necessary organizational principles, structures and policies for good order and to meet legal requirements. Taken together, these governing documents reflect the organic whole of this church in its interdependent relationships and as part of the one holy, catholic, and apostolic Church; and

7. WHEREAS, the Constitutions, Bylaws, and Continuing Resolutions of the ELCA require that rostered congregations adopt constitutions which are not inconsistent with the Constitutions, Bylaws, and Continuing Resolutions of the ELCA and the Synod; and

8. WHEREAS, section 13.22 of the Constitution of the Synod requires that each congregation of the ELCA within the territory of this synod shall establish and maintain a relationship with this synod; and

9. WHEREAS, Section 9.62 of the Constitution of the ELCA provides the procedure by which a congregation may terminate its relationship with this church. Section 9.62(h) of the Constitution of the ELCA requires that congregations which had been members of the Lutheran Church in America shall be required to receive synodical approval before terminating their membership in this church; and

10. WHEREAS, the civil law relating to the organizational principles and governance structures of churches and religious organizations within the State of New York is the New York Religious Corporations Law. Section 17-c (2)(b) of the Religious Corporations Law provides the civil procedure by which the relationship between a congregation of the ELCA and the ELCA may be terminated. Section 17-c (2)(b)(vii) mandates that congregations which had been members of the Lutheran Church in America shall be required to receive Synodical approval before terminating their membership in the Church; and

11. WHEREAS, by letter dated July 18, 2012, Grace Evangelical Lutheran Church informed the Synod of its termination of its relationship with the ELCA and the Synod, without having first obtained the approval of the Synod, in direct violation of both ecclesial and civil law as above recited; and

12. WHEREAS, it is acknowledged that all power in the Church belongs to our Lord Jesus Christ, its head, and all actions of the Church and Synod are to be carried out under his rule and authority. The Church exists both as an inclusive fellowship and as local congregations gathered for worship and Christian service. Congregations find their fulfillment in the universal community of the Church, and the universal Church exists in and through congregations; and

13. WHEREAS, the Church is a people created by God in Christ,

empowered by the Holy Spirit, called and sent to bear witness to God's creative, redeeming, and sanctifying activity in the world. To participate in God's mission, this Synod as a part of the Church shall proclaim God's saving Gospel, preserving and transmitting the Gospel faithfully to future generations; shall carry out Christ's Great Commission by reaching out to all people to bring them to faith in Christ and by doing all ministry with a global awareness consistent with the understanding of God as Creator, Redeemer, and Sanctifier of all; shall serve in response to God's love to meet human needs, caring for the sick and the aged, advocating dignity and justice for all people, working for peace and reconciliation among the nations, and standing with the poor and powerless, and committing itself to their needs; shall worship God in proclamation of the Word and administration of the sacraments and through lives of prayer, praise, thanksgiving, witness, and service; shall nurture its members in the Word of God so as to grow in faith and hope and love, to see daily life as the primary setting for the exercise of their Christian calling, and to use the gifts of the Spirit for their life together and for their calling in the world; shall manifest the unity given to the people of God by living together in the love of Christ and by joining with other Christians in prayer and action to express and preserve the unity which the Spirit gives; and

14. WHEREAS, to fulfill these purposes, this Synod, in partnership with the churchwide organization, bears primary responsibility for the oversight of the life and mission of this church in the territory of this synod;

NOW THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED that pursuant to the authority granted to it by both ecclesial and civil law as above recited, in fulfillment of its primary responsibility for the oversight of the life and mission of this church in the territory of this synod, in consideration of the mission and ministry of this synod and in furtherance of the pastoral care of congregations, ordained ministers, associates in ministry, deaconesses, and diaconal ministers of this church in this synod, approval of the request of Grace Evangelical Lutheran Church to terminate its relationship with the ELCA and this Synod is hereby denied; and

RESOLVED, that a copy of these Resolutions, together with a certificate of the Secretary of the Synod, be delivered to and filed with Grace Evangelical Lutheran Church with additional copies the Secretary of its Congregation Council; and

RESOLVED, that a copy of these Resolutions, together with a certificate of the Secretary of the Synod, be delivered to and filed with the Secretary of the Evangelical Lutheran Church in America; and

RESOLVED, that a copy of these Resolutions, together with a certificate of the Secretary of the Synod, be delivered to and filed with the Attorney General of the State of New York (Charities Bureau); and

RESOLVED, that a copy of these Resolutions, together with a certificate of the Secretary of the Synod, be delivered to and filed with any Federal, state or local governmental agency, bureau, department or body, including but not limited to the United States Internal Revenue Service, as may be deemed reasonable, necessary or desirable in furtherance of or to effectuate or memorialize the existence or intentions of



these Resolutions.

Motion made to amend resolution to immediately impose permanent synodical administration on Grace, North Branch by adding the following resolve:

RESOLVED, that permanent synod administration under section 13.24 of the Synod Constitution be imposed upon Grace Lutheran Church, North Branch, New York.

This amendment was approved unanimously.

The 2012 Synod Assembly's Congregational Viability Norms were considered in the conversations regarding imposition of synod administration upon the congregation of Grace.

**ACTION SC12:09/10**

**RESOLVED that pursuant to the authority granted to it by both ecclesial and civil law as above recited, in fulfillment of its primary responsibility for the oversight of the life and mission of this church in the territory of this synod, in consideration of the mission and ministry of this synod and in furtherance of the pastoral care of congregations, ordained ministers, associates in ministry, deaconesses, and diaconal ministers of this church in this synod, approval of the request of Grace Evangelical Lutheran Church to terminate its relationship with the ELCA and this Synod is hereby denied; and**

**RESOLVED, that a copy of these Resolutions, together with a certificate of the Secretary of the Synod, be delivered to and filed with Grace Evangelical Lutheran Church with additional copies the Secretary of its Congregation Council; and**

**RESOLVED, that a copy of these Resolutions, together with a certificate of the Secretary of the Synod, be delivered to and filed with the Secretary of the Evangelical Lutheran Church in America; and**

**RESOLVED, that a copy of these Resolutions, together with a certificate of the Secretary of the Synod, be delivered to and filed with the Attorney General of the State of New York (Charities Bureau); and**

**RESOLVED, that a copy of these Resolutions, together with a certificate of the Secretary of the Synod, be delivered to and filed with any Federal, state or local governmental agency, bureau, department or body, including but not limited to the United States Internal Revenue Service, as may be deemed reasonable, necessary or desirable in furtherance of or to effectuate or memorialize the existence or intentions of these Resolutions; and**

**RESOLVED, that permanent synod administration under section 13.24 of the Synod Constitution be imposed upon Grace Lutheran Church, North Branch, New York.**

**ADOPTED unanimously.**

**ACTION SC12:09/11**

**RESOLVED**, that Dcn. Charles Germain, Rev. Ernie Mosl (Dean) and Pr. Jack Horner be appointed trustees of Grace Lutheran Church, North Branch, NY.

**ADOPTED**

- f. Leif Ericson Day School Covenant  
Pr. Jonathan Linman reported on meetings with the school.

**8. New Business**

- A. 2013 Compensation Guidelines  
Ms. Kathleen Schmidt reported.

**ACTION SC12:09/12**

**RESOLVED**, that the COLA for the 2013 Compensation Guidelines be 2.65%.

**ADOPTED**

- B. Vacant Synod Council Seat: Miryan Fernandez  
VP Del Toro announced that letter of resignation was received from Ms. Fernandez and that resignation has been accepted.
- C. Dobbs Ferry Lutheran Church, Dobbs Ferry: sale of property

**ACTION SC12:09/13**

**RESOLVED**, that the Synod Council ratify the action of the Executive Committee in taking no exception to the sale of a two family dwelling at 2 Storm Street, Dobbs Ferry, NY .

**ADOPTED**

- D. Epiphany Lutheran Church, Bronx: sale  
Pr. Linman spoke about proposed sale and how the proceeds will be used by the congregation.

**ACTION SC12:09/14**

**RESOLVED**, that the Synod Council take no exception to the sale of property located at 302 East 206<sup>th</sup> Street, Bronx, New York by The Evangelical Lutheran Church of the Epiphany.

**ADOPTED**

- E. Nomination for Synod Council vacancy: Ms. Hazel Goldstein

**ACTION SC12:09/15**

**RESOLVED**, that Ms. Hazel Goldstein is appointed to fill the vacancy on the Synod Council created by the resignation of Ms. Miryan Fernandez, term to begin immediately and run through May 2016.

**ADOPTED**

- F. Report of unanimous vote to appoint Marc Herbst to Synod Council

**ACTION SC12:09/16**

**RESOLVED**, that Rev. Marc Herbst was appointed by unanimous electronic vote of the Synod Council on August 1, 2012 to serve the unexpired term of Rev. Perry Kirschbaum, term to begin immediately and run through May 2014.

**ADOPTED**

**9. Other Reports**

Dcn. Charles Germain announced several upcoming events for youth.

**10. Announcements/Events**

- A. Synod Council Retreat: October 26-27, 2012 (5 pm)  
St. Ignatius Retreat House, Manhasset, New York
- B. Reception for Mr. Robert Buescher, Pr. Gary Mills: October 27 (3-5pm)  
St. Ignatius Retreat House, Manhasset
- C. VP Del Toro announced that November 13 SC meeting is cancelled.
- D. Rev. Craig Miller and Rev. Kit Robison will be observers for the SC retreat in October.  
Ms. Karen Woolley will be observer for December SC meeting.
- E. Dr. Carlos Lopez will give devotions at December SC meeting.
- F. Bp Rimbo noted that Bp. Roy Riley of New Jersey will be on call while he is out of the country.

**11. Meeting Evaluation**

**12. Observer's Evaluation**

**Meeting was adjourned at 4:00 pm with prayer by Rev. Craig Miller.**

Respectfully submitted,  
Rev. Robert Schoepflin  
Secretary, MNYS